

JHERONIMUS BOSCH

HIS WORKSHOP, AND HIS FOLLOWERS



*5th International Jheronimus Bosch Conference
May 11-13, 2023*

*Jheronimus Bosch Art Center
's-Hertogenbosch, The Netherlands*

Jheronimus Bosch Art Center



JHERONIMUS BOSCH

HIS WORKSHOP AND HIS FOLLOWERS

*5th International
Jheronimus Bosch Conference*

*May 11-13, 2023
Jheronimus Bosch Art Center*

*'s-Hertogenbosch
The Netherlands*

Jheronimus Bosch Art Center



Contents

Preface	7
Jheronimus Bosch and the Renaissance in Europe <i>Bernard Aikema</i>	10
Bosch's Earthly Paradises: the left panels of the <i>Garden of Earthly Delights</i> , the <i>Vienna Last Judgement</i> and the <i>Haywain</i> <i>Jasmijn van Benthum</i>	28
A novel reading for the <i>Garden of Earthly Delights</i> : from new evidence in the image to a political narrative interpretation (the ABC hypothesis). <i>Manuel Berdoy</i>	50
Mandijn's Monsters: Shining a light on the techniques and motifs of a Bosch follower <i>Kathryn Harada and Abbie Vandivere</i>	74
The link between Bosch and Bruegel: Pieter Coecke's workshop as intermediary <i>Astrid Hobill</i>	96
In the Manner of Jan Wellens de Cock? A Study of the Chimei Museum's <i>Christ in Limbo</i> <i>Yu Han Hsu</i>	110
Four of the Triptychs by Jheronimus Bosch as 'exempla iustitiae' and Albrecht Dürer's 'gross Beth' <i>Jos Koldewey</i>	134
Jheronimus Bosch, Observations on his painting style <i>Fritz Koreny</i>	168
Listening to the angels... or why the <i>Last Judgement</i> from the collection of the Wavel Royal Castle in Cracow was not painted by Jheronimus Bosch <i>Grzegorz Kubies</i>	182
'A Rose by Any Other Name': Connoisseurship and Questions of Attribution in Jheronimus Bosch's <i>Haywain Triptych</i> <i>Marie-Eve Lafontaine</i>	204

With the 'Rockman' from 'Bosch' to 'Van Oostanen'	228
<i>Meinhard Michael</i>	
Facing the end of time. The work of Jheronimus Bosch considered in the context of apocalyptic eschatology and the reform movements	254
<i>Frans Nies</i>	
<i>The Dream of Raphael</i> or <i>The Allegory of Human Life</i> by Giorgio Ghisi and its pictorial copies: the success of a motif 'd'après Bosch' in the second half of the sixteenth century	276
<i>Claudio Salsi</i>	
The painters Jan Claessoen and Ghysbrecht Tyssoen Hoeyen; specialised employees of Jheronimus Bosch?	298
<i>Loes Scholten</i>	
The Vienna <i>Last Judgement</i> revisited: The underdrawings	322
<i>Ron Spronk</i>	
The Vienna <i>Last Judgement</i> revisited: Notes on comparing paintings	342
<i>Luuk Hoogstede</i>	
Family functions: reviewing the Van Aken workshop	356
<i>Dorien Tamis</i>	
Between Bosch and Bruegel. <i>Catalepton</i> ('Trifles')	374
What links the engravings <i>Saint Martin</i> after Jheronimus Bosch and <i>Hope</i> after Pieter Bruegel the Elder?	
<i>Joanna A. Tomicka</i>	
Bosch Imitators in Spain during the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries	382
<i>Elena Vázquez Dueñas</i>	
Filling the void. Copies of Bosch's <i>Ecce Homo</i>	400
<i>Marieke van Wamel</i>	
Bosch's Saint-Germain-en-Laye <i>Conjurer</i>: Autograph, Workshop or Follower? Can the Unrecognized Subject Determine Authorship?	416
<i>Diana Withee</i>	

Bosch Imitators in Spain during the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries

Elena Vázquez Dueñas

Dr E. Vázquez Dueñas (Complutense University of Madrid, Spain)

Elena Vázquez Dueñas completed her Doctorate in Art History in 2011 at the Complutense University in Madrid with her thesis *Felipe de Guevara. Biography and critical analysis of his Commentary on Painting and Ancient Painters*. In addition to this critical edition, in 2016 she published *El Bosco en las fuentes españolas* ('Bosch in Spanish sources'). Moreover, she has written several articles about these topics and participated in various international conferences. Dr. Vázquez Dueñas obtained doctoral grant funding from the Spanish Ministry to work at the Complutense University, and a 'Juan de la Cierva' postdoctoral contract at Fundación Carlos de Amberes in Madrid. She has done several research stays at the Kunsthistorisches Institut (Florence), Archives Générales du Royaume (Brussels) and The Warburg Institute (London). Her specialization is also the transcription and study of Spanish Royal Inventories of the Habsburg Family. She has been a member of various research projects linked to the Complutense University, such as *Spaces of collecting*. Nowadays, she is a lecturer in art history at this university and associated researcher of *Moll Institute. Research Center of Flemish Paintings*.

It is a well-known fact that Bosch's paintings have always been highly popular in Spain. One of his greatest admirers was, without a doubt, King Philip II (1527-1598), who acquired a good number of them. Although it is difficult to determine when he discovered Bosch's paintings for the first time, we know that Bosch was not an unknown painter in Philip II's circles. In the inventory of Isabel la Católica (1451-1504), made up in 1505, there is already a work that can probably be attributed to Bosch.¹ Philip the Fair (1478-1506) had commissioned the painter to create a large *Last Judgement* that he may never have finished. Works by the artist were also owned by Philip the Fair's sister Margareth of Austria (1480-1530) and by the collector and patron of artworks Diego de Guevara (c.1450-1520), who worked as an ambassador for Philip the Fair and Margareth of Austria. Guevara was a member of the Brotherhood of Our Lady in 's-Hertogenbosch of which Bosch was a member as well. His splendid collection of paintings was inherited by his son Felipe (c. 1510-1563), who first served Charles V as a *gentilhombre de boca*, accompanying him at his coronation in Bologna in 1530, and on the Tunis Expedition in 1535. Shortly after he settled in Madrid, together with his wife Beatriz de Haro, in a house located next to the Royal Alcazar. He also served as a courtier to Philip II.

In 1549, when the then Prince Philip undertook his study trip through the Netherlands, Jheronimus Bosch's work was therefore already well known to him. During his sojourn in 's-Hertogenbosch he also had the chance to contemplate some of Bosch's other works in Saint John's Church. It was precisely there that we know, thanks to the narrative of Juan Cristóbal Calvete de Estrella, that he saw an astronomical clock that attracted his attention for its 'rare and excellent invention'. It would not be surprising if Bosch had participated in its decoration, since it fits quite well with the Boschian aesthetic. Calvete de Estrella describes it as follows:²

'se veen en el grandes misterios, que assí como da las horas, salen los tres Reyes Magos uno a uno y adoran al niño Jesús que tiene la Virgen su madre en los braços; luego, al son de dos trompetas que tocan dos ángeles, salen por su orden y se muestra el juycio universal, y levántanse los muertos y luego salen los ángeles que apartan los buenos de los malos. Allí parece y se vee a una parte la gloria y a la otra el infierno, que abre su boca, y caen los dañados de cabeça en ella, todo hecho de ymágenes de bulto y con tanto artificio y ingenio que es cosa de admiración y que pone religión y temor en los ánimos.' (In it are seen the great mysteries, that just as the hours strike, the three Wise Men come out one by one and adore the Christ child, who the Virgin his mother has in her arms; then, to the sound of two trumpets played by two angels, they come out in their order and the universal judgment is shown, and the dead rise and then the angels come out and separate the good from the bad. There, Glory appears, and can be seen on one side, and on the other, hell, which opens its mouth and the damned fall headlong into it, all made of sculptures and with so much artifice and ingenuity that it is a matter of admiration and one that puts religion and fear in minds.)

In Brussels, Philip also had the opportunity to see *The Garden of Earthly Delights*, which at that time hung in the Nassau Palace.³ It must have been an unforgettable experience, which is why he did not hesitate to order a copy.⁴ Eighteen years later the original was confiscated, together with other works, from William of Orange by the Duke of Alba, in the midst of violent riots. The triptych later passed to the collection of the illegitimate son of the Duke of Alba, the prior Don Fernando. It was at his auction, in 1591, that King Philip II finally had the opportunity to buy all these paintings, including the original *Garden of Earthly Delights*, assigning them to the Monastery of El Escorial in 1593.⁵

Some years earlier, in 1570, he had already acquired a large part of the collection of paintings of the courtier and antiquarian Felipe de Guevara, including those by Bosch, from Guevara's widow and his son Ladrón, as well as his house, which he would transform into a school for pages.⁶

As interesting as the presence of Bosch's originals in Spanish Royal collections may be, this paper will focus on the works of his imitators. In fact, in around 1560 Felipe de Guevara wrote in his *Commentary on Painting and Ancient Painters* that there were many imitations of Bosch's paintings in Spain, some even fraudulently signed with his name.⁷ The first question to be asked, therefore, is: Could King Philip II have acquired any works by these imitators?

Two of the main documents which tell us about Philip II's artistic collection are the *Delivery Books to El Escorial* and his post-mortem inventory. All of Bosch's paintings described in them are cited as 'de su mano' (by his hand). However, we know that not all of them could have been. For example, among Bosch's paintings that Philip II acquired from the Guevara family there was another version of the *Haywain*, identified nowadays as the work of an imitator, despite being signed. Moreover, it is described in the *First Delivery to El Escorial* (1574) as if it was an original work:

'Una tabla de pintura con dos puertas en que esta pintado de pinzel un carro de heno que toman de él todos los estados que denota la vanidad tras que anda y encima del heno una figura del angel de la guarda y el demonio y otras figuras y en lo alto de la tabla Dios Padre y en la tabla de mano derecha la Creacion de Adan y otras figuras de la misma historia y en la de mano izquierda el Infierno y las penas de los peccados mortales que tiene cinco pies de alto y quatro de ancho sin las puertas. Es de mano de Geronimo Bosqui.'⁸ (A painted panel with two wings, on which is depicted a haywain being plucked at by everyone, symbolizing the pursuit of vanity, and atop the hay stands a guardian angel and the devil and other figures, and at the very top God the Father, and on the right-hand wing the Creation of Adam and other figures from the same story, and on the left-hand wing hell and the punishment of the mortal sins, it is 5 feet high and 4 feet wide, without the wings: it is by Jheronimus Bosch.)⁹

In this same *First Delivery* (1574) three 'Temptations of Saint Anthony' are cited, among them:

'Otra tabla con dos pares de puertas dobladas, en la de en medio pintado la tentacion de Sant Anton de mano de Geronimo Bosqui pintadas las puertas por todas partes que tienen de alto quatro pies y de ancho tres y medio sin las puertas.'¹⁰ (Another panel with two pairs of double wings, painted on the central panel is the Temptation of Saint Anthony, by the hand of Jheronimus Bosch, the wings painted on all sides, 4 feet high and 3 ½ feet wide without the wings.)¹¹

The side panels are probably the two wings of *Temptations of Saint Anthony*, which are currently preserved in the Prado Museum (P02050 and P02051). They are considered copies after Bosch, originating from the Royal Monastery of El Escorial. Regarding the central panel (1550-60), it has been suggested that it could be the *Temptations of Saint Anthony* by a follower of Bosch, which is also preserved in the Prado Museum (P003085), originating from the ancient Casa Ducal de Osuna.¹² All the panels imitate, with some variations, the original triptych by Bosch preserved in Lisbon. Philip II, during his stay in this city, probably saw this original triptych and acquired or commissioned a copy.¹³

Other artworks by these imitators are also found in the Royal House of El Pardo. The earliest preserved inventory is dated 1564. Only a 'Temptation of Saint Anthony' is cited as being by Bosch, but we know from a comparison with later inventories that more of the paintings cited in 1564 were considered to be by Bosch.

In his *Discurso sobre el libro de la Montería* (1582) the antiquarian Gonzalo Argote de Molina (1548-1596) described the paintings by Bosch which hung in the Royal House of El Pardo. He mentioned one identified as the 'Monstrous Child', but also seven 'Temptations of Saint Anthony'. Although this theme is the most frequent in Bosch's works, Pilar Silva finds it 'hard to believe that there were seven in the Pardo Palace'.¹⁴ It is possible that Argote was referring to copies as well. We have, in fact, documentary evidence that at least in 1623 several paintings with this theme must have hung in this palace, including originals and copies. In order to find out what some of these paintings could be, it is necessary to check several inventories:

'Otra tabla pintada al olio de Geronimo Bosque con San Antonio en medio hincado de rodillas y el niño Jesús al lado con su marco de oro y negro.'¹⁵ (Another panel painted in oil by Jheronimus Bosch with Saint Anthony in the middle on his knees and the baby Jesus on the side with its gold and black frame.)¹⁶

It was located in the antechamber. The inventory of 1623 also includes a possible copy of it:

'Otro lienço de Geronimo Bosque copiado que es la tentación de San Antonio que esta con un libro en las manos y el niño Jesús a su lado tiene el marco de oro y negro y una moldura fingida.'¹⁷ (Another canvas by Jheronimus Bosch, copied, which is the temptation of Saint Anthony with a book in his hands and the baby Jesus at his side, it has



Figure 1

After Pieter Bruegel the Elder, *Temptations of Saint Anthony*, 1556, engraving, sheet: 26.2 x 33.9 cm, New York, Metropolitan Museum of Art, inv. 28.4(13) Harris Brisbane Dick Fund, 1928 <https://www.metmuseum.org/art/collection/search/383057>



Figure 2

Joos Van Craesbeeck, *Temptations of Sain Anthony*, c. 1650, Oil on canvas, 78 x 116 cm, Karlsruhe, Staatliche Kunsthalle, cat. 2764 (Source: Wikipedia)

a gold and black frame and an imitation molding.)¹⁸

However, in the inventories dated 1653 and 1674 both paintings are cited as by Bosch.

'Otro lienço grande pintado al fresco en tabla de Geronimo Bosco de la tentacion de San Antonio que tiene una cabeça muy grande con un diente mellado y abajo un hombre y una mujer dormidos en su marco dorados.'¹⁹ (Another large canvas painted al fresco on panel by Jheronimus Bosch, which is a temptation of Saint Anthony who has a very big head with a gap tooth and below a man and woman sleeping with its gilt frame.)

In the same inventory of 1614 a copy of it 'with the same story' and 'with the same figures' without a frame is cited. In the inventory of 1623 only one of them is mentioned in the Queen's staircase. It must be the original one because it is cited with a frame.

An engraving made after a composition by Pieter Bruegel the Elder provides us with the image of this large gap-toothed head, linked to the theme of the Temptations of Saint Anthony (Fig. 1). In the Correr Museum in Venice, a painting by Herri met de Bles with these same characteristics is preserved and, in addition, the painter Joos van Craesbeeck repeated this theme in the middle of the seventeenth century (Fig. 2) in a work clearly influenced by Bosch.

In the inventory dated 1564 a canvas representing Justice is also cited. In the inventory of 1614, there are two paintings with this theme: the original one, placed in the 'pieza donde comen las damas' (Ladies' Dining Room), and a copy in the 'sala del antecámara' (antechamber). Thanks to the description of the latter, we know more details about the painting: 'llevan a un hombre arrastrando y la mujer del berdugo a caualllo con su marco de oro y negro' (... which has a man dragged on the ground and the executioner's wife on horseback with its gold and black frame). This copy was made in 1607 by the painter Francisco Granelo, about whom we know very little. Records show that the Cathedral Chapter of Toledo named him as its painter on March 8, 1627, and that he died on May 15, 1629. We do not know his works, but it is likely that they are in Madrid and Toledo, attributed to other painters. In his *Historical Dictionary* (1800) Ceán Bermúdez also added that he could have been one of the four sons of Nicolás Granelo. The latter was known, above all, for his work in the Monastery of El Escorial, painting several works with his brother Fabricio. Among them are the battle of Higuera, the Battle of San Quintín and the vault decorated with grotesques in the chapter room.²⁰

A few years later, in 1611, the Genoese painter Julio César Semín was commissioned to make copies of three other paintings by Bosch, specifically: the 'Tower of Babylon', the 'Monstrous Child' and the 'Temptation of Saint Anthony with the large head' mentioned above. The reason for this commission was the fact that the originals were badly damaged ('viejos y rotos', old and broken), particularly the 'Monstrous Child' and the 'Tower of Babylon'. All

these paintings must have suffered considerable damage as a result of the palace fire in 1604. In 1610, Julio César Semín had completed his most important commission: the decoration of the vault of the King's antechamber in the El Pardo Palace. This work was started in May 1607 by his father Alejandro, but he died just a few months later, so his son Julio César continued the work in October of that same year. This work was the highlight of his career, as Julio César had never held the title of King's painter, generally carrying out small-scale works. He painted, for example, coats of arms on burial mounds of different royal characters, but he also retouched some canvases by cleaning them, giving them a new layer of varnish and painting their frames gold and black. In 1633 it is recorded that he received three payments for painting a series of balconies and railings in gold and green for the Buen Retiro Palace.²¹

The 1614 inventory of the Palace of El Pardo also records a copy of *The Garden of Earthly Delights* in the Audience chamber, as Isabel Mateo pointed out in 1967.²² It is described as:

'Una tabla de Geronimo Bosque grande pintada al olio en tabla con sus dos medias puertas, en la una pintado la creacion con Adam y Eba, en el medio el trafago del mundo y en la otra media puerta las penas del ynfierno con su guarnicion de madera de oro y negro.'²³ (A large panel by Jheronimus Bosch painted in oil on panel with its two wings, on one of which painted the Creation, with Adam and Eve, in the middle the course of the world, and on the other wing the punishments in hell, with its wooden frame in gold and black.)²⁴

In 1623 it was still situated in the same place, according to the inventory dated March 20th of that year. Several months later, on 3 October, in another inventory of the Palace of El Pardo, a painting is mentioned as: 'otra pintura grande con puertas del mundo' (another large painting with wings of the world). The same document has a list of paintings which were sent from El Pardo to Madrid by order of their Majesties. Among them is 'una pintura con sus puertas del mundo y su creacion. Copia de Jeronimo Bosque' (a painting with its wings of the world and Creation. Copy after Jheronimus Bosch).²⁵ Generally, it has been interpreted that it was the same copy of *The Garden of Earthly Delights*, mentioned in earlier inventories, which was moved to the Alcazar of Madrid.

In 1636, a copy of this triptych of *The Garden of Earthly Delights* is cited in the Inventory of the Royal Palace of Madrid, but dismantled, in the room in which His Majesty eats, on the ground floor ('pieza en que su Magestad come en el cuarto bajo'):

'Una tabla quadrada al olio que parece de Geronimo Bosco con moldura dorada y negra con mucha diuersidad de figuras y en lo alto una laguna en que esta un globo con un remate encima y en lo bajo dos figuras a cada lado la suya de negros y cada uno una cereza en la cabeza'. (A square panel, painted in oil, which seems to be by Jheronimus Bosch, with a gilt and black frame, with a great variety of figures, and at the top a lake, in

which floats an orb with a decoration on top, and below two figures stand on either side of black people, both carrying a red cherry on their heads.)

‘Otras dos tablas, que eran puertas de la dicha arriba y en la una de ellas esta pintado Dios Padre, vestido de colorado en medio de Adan y Eva, desnudos y un gato bermejo con un raton en la boca y en la otra todos los tormentos de los siete pecados mortales y en lo bajo un puerco vestido de monja que estaba besando a un hombre.’²⁶ (Two more panels, which were the wings of the above-mentioned painting; on one is painted God the Father, dressed in red, between the naked Adam and Eve, and with a ginger cat with a rat in its mouth, and on the other (is a depiction of) all the punishments of the Seven Deadly Sins, below which is a pig dressed as a nun and kissing a man.)²⁷

In 1776, Antonio Ponz found a complete copy of the triptych of *The Garden of Earthly Delights*, in the Gallery of Infanta in Casa de Campo.²⁸ It has been suggested that it could have been reassembled and moved there. However, according to Bart Franssen it was most probably another copy.²⁹ In any case, only the copy of the left panel, which represents the Creation, is preserved and is currently in the Monastery of El Escorial as a deposit of the Prado Museum (n^o 2053).

It should also be noted that in the inventory of the paintings found in different parts of the Royal Palace of Madrid, with a probable date of 1686, a group of paintings, clearly identifiable as works by Arcimboldo, are mentioned as from the ‘Bosch school’:

‘Una cabeza en tabla conpuesta de frutas y espigas de la escuela de Geronimo Bosco’ (A head on a panel composed of fruits and spikes from the school of Jheronimus Bosch) and ‘Otra pintura de una bara de alto de una caueça compuesta de diferentes baratijas de la escuela de Geronimo Bosco’ (Another painting of one ell high of a head composed of different trinkets by the school of Jheronimus Bosch).³⁰

Bosch’s imitators in Spanish collections

The objective of the second part of this paper is to analyze two paintings, currently preserved in Spanish collections. The first one is preserved in the Dean’s Palace in Tudela. It represents the Last Judgement in the last days of the world, when all Humanity will be judged by their acts (Fig. 3).³¹

In the upper part Christ the Judge is depicted in Glory within a mandorla. On each side, among the clouds, two angels with trumpets, flanked by six apostles each, call the Last Judgement. It is clearly inspired by the central panel of Bosch’s *Last Judgement Triptych* in Vienna, but it is not a literal copy. At first glance, a notable difference is that in this part we do not see Saint John the Baptist and Virgin Mary as intercessors. The rest of the composition is mostly occupied by the sinners, although in the Tudela painting the blessed are also



Figure 3
Follower of Jheronimus Bosch, *Last Judgement*, c. 1550, oil on panel, 70 x 76 cm, Tudela (Navarra), Museum of Tudela's Cathedral



Figure 4
Jheronimus Bosch, *Christ in Limbo*, c. 1550, oil on panel, 55 x 74 cm, Vienna, Kunsthistorisches Museum, cat. GG_2715 (Source: Wikimedia)



Figure 5
Follower of Jheronimus Bosch, *Christ in Limbo*, c. 1575, oil on panel, 58.1 x 72.1 cm,
Indianapolis Museum of Art, inv. 63.10 (Source: Wikipedia)



Figure 6
Follower of Jheronimus Bosch, *Christ in Limbo*, c. 1550, oil on panel, Springfield
(Massachusetts), Museum of Fine Arts (Source: Wikimedia)



Figure 7
Follower of Jheronimus Bosch, *The Vision of Tundale*, c. 1485, oil on panel, 68.6 × 84.8 cm,
Denver, Art Museum, Funds from Helen Dill bequest, 1948.37 (Source: Wikimedia)



Figure 8
Follower of Jheronimus Bosch, *The Temptation of Saint Antony*, Private Collection Spain
Source: Aterido (ed.) 2013, pp. 64-65 (image)

represented. In the background, there is a typical Boschian hell in gloom, illuminated by several sources of light. In the foreground, the condemned receive different punishments. Some motifs are inspired by Bosch's works, while others could be the result of the imitator's imagination. The funnel into which group of sinners enter, and the great head that widens its large mouth to house more of the condemned, are taken from works of Bosch's followers, representing *Christ in Limbo*; for example, the one kept in the Kunsthistorisches Museum in Vienna (Fig. 4). Other examples can be found in the Indianapolis Museum of Art (Fig. 5) and in the Museum of Fine Arts in Springfield (Fig. 6).

However, in all of these paintings, this great head is represented a little differently. In the Tudela painting the tavern in which demons force the sinners to eat and drink is depicted inside the mouth, instead of on top of the head, as in the other examples. This is a clear reference to gluttony, one of the seven deadly sins. One man is forced to drink by a demon, while another has already fallen over the table. Another demon brings the sinners a new dish that will be far from delicious.

Philip II had a *Christ in Limbo* described in inventories as an original Bosch, but it was also imitated very frequently by his followers.

There is a similar representation of this head in a *Tondal's Vision*, preserved in the Art Museum in Denver (Fig. 7), done by an imitator of Bosch. There are also other analogous motifs, such as a man inside a vessel full of coins, a man vomiting, being helped by a demon, and a man being cooked by a demon. In contrast, the men and women dancing to the sound of a bagpipe played by a demon refers to Hell in *The Garden of Earthly Delights*.

As previously mentioned, there is also a place for the blessed in this Tudela painting. We can see a group being led by an angel in a boat to Paradise, while not far away, another boat with sinners is burning in flames.³²

This panel was first exhibited in 1929 in the International Exhibition in Barcelona as an imitation or copy after Bosch. It was also included in the Monumental Catalog of Navarra, where it was considered an acceptable copy after Bosch and attributed to an Aragonese painter close to the style of Pedro Pertús (1546-1583), who worked in Zaragoza and Tudela.³³ It was also included by Elisa Bermejo in her 1982 catalog. It is dated in the middle of the sixteenth century.³⁴

Additionally, there is another work which represents the *Temptations of Saint Anthony* preserved in the Masaveu collection (Fig. 8).³⁵ It must be the same painting Gamelo considered an original by Bosch when he saw it in 1925 in Madrid as part of the Marquis del Riscal's collection.³⁶ However, it has lately been attributed to a follower. Its inspiration is clearly the central panel of the *Temptation of Saint Anthony Triptych* preserved in Lisbon, but with some variations. Several motifs, such as the mussel and the couple standing in a large



Figure 9
Imitator of Pieter Huys, *The Temptation of Saint Anthony*, 1570-1599, oil on panel, 17.8 x 22.2 cm, Kingston Lacy Estate (Dorset), National Trust Collections, cat. 1257120 (Source: Wikidata)



Figure 10
Pieter Huys, *The Temptation of Saint Anthony*, 1577, oil on panel, 77 x 93.9 cm, Antwerp, Museum Mayer van den Bergh, cat. 25 (Source: Wikimedia)

fruit floating on the water, must come from *The Garden of Earthly Delights*. The discovery of this other painting belonging to a private collection leads us to new conclusions.

A similar copy can be found by an imitator of Peter Huys (Fig. 9). The Museum Mayer van den Bergh in Antwerp preserves another partially similar *Temptation of Saint Anthony* (Fig. 10), attributed to Peter Huys, as mentioned in the catalog of Master artworks from the Masaveu Collection in 1989.³⁷

The similarity of these paintings seems to indicate that these followers were copying an original painting by Bosch. Moreover, the Royal inventories give some descriptions that could correspond to this painting, such as:

‘Otra tabla pintada al olio de Geronimo Bosque con San Antonio en medio hincado de rodillas y el niño Jesus al lado’ (Another panel painted in oil by Jheronimus Bosch with Saint Anthony in the middle on his knees and the Jesus child on the side).

This reference is included in the inventory of the Royal House of El Pardo in 1614, but some years later, in 1623, a possible copy is also cited:

‘Otro lienço de Geronimo Bosque copiado que es la tentacion de San Antonio que esta con un libro en las manos y el niño Jesus a su lado’ (Another canvas by Hieronymus Bosch which is the Temptation of Saint Anthony, who is with his book on his hands and the Jesus child on the side).

We indeed see Saint Anthony on his knees concentrating on reading. Behind him is a male figure who, from the sign he makes to us with his hand, has been identified as Christ. But he lacks a beard and, due to his appearance, does not seem to be an adult. It could be a portrayal of a ‘young or child Jesus’.

It could also correspond with this description found in the inventory of the Royal Palace in 1636:

‘Una pintura sobre tabla de quatro pies de largo poco mas o menos con moldura dorada y negra de mano de Geronimo Bosco de San Antonio pintado de medio perfil mirando a un rio y a la mano derecha un pauellon con una mesa que parece que estan comiendo.’ (A painting on panel, four feet wide, more or less, with a gilt and black frame, by the hand of Jheronimus Bosch, with Saint Anthony, painted in three quarter profile, gazing out across a river, and on the right is a small building with a table at which it seems that people are eating.)

This scene appears to allude to the sin of gluttony.

Without any doubt, the painting belonging to the Masaveu collection is of the best quality.

Moreover, the existence of all these very similar paintings makes us wonder whether this might actually be the original Bosch.

In conclusion, the presence of works by Bosch and his followers in Spain constitutes a subject of great interest worthy of being studied in depth, since there is still much that remains to be discovered.

1. 'Otra tabla mas pequeña que la susodicha que tiene en el medio una mujer desnuda con unos cabellos largos las manos juntas y en lo baxo en el cerco dorado un letrero de letras negras que dize Jeronimus'. (Another panel smaller than the above-mentioned one, which has in the middle a naked woman with long hair and her hands together and in the lower part a golden circle with a sign in black letters that says Jeronimus). Cited in: Vázquez Dueñas 2016a, p. 23.
2. Calvete de Estrella (ed. P. Cuenca) 2001, p. 449.
3. Silva Maroto 2000, p. 23.
4. *Idem*, p. 28. According to Pilar Silva, although the first mention of this copy appears in the time of Philip III in the El Pardo Palace inventory, dated 1614, it is most probable that it originally belonged to Philip II. He could have placed it in the Alcazar of Madrid.
5. It is described in the Sixth Delivery Book: 'Una pintura en tabla al ollio con dos puertas de la variedad del mundo çifrada con diuersos disparates de Hieronimo Bosco que llaman del madroño con molduras doradas. Tiene de alto cerradas las puertas dos bars y media y de ancho dos y tercia que se compro del almoneda del prior don Fernando' (A panel painting in oil with two doors of the variety of the world depicting various nonsensical ideas by Hieronimo Bosco that they call the strawberry tree with golden moldings. It has with closed doors a height of two and a half ells and a width of two and a third ells, which was bought from the prior Don Fernando's auction). Checa Cremades (ed.) 2013, p. 400.
6. Matilla Tascón 1988, pp. 258-61; Vázquez Dueñas 2018, pp. 173-74.
7. Vázquez Dueñas 2016b, p. 190.
8. Checa Cremades (ed.) 2013, pp. 212-13.
9. Translated into English in: Vandenbroeck 2001, p. 52.
10. Checa Cremades (ed.) 2013, p. 212.
11. Translated into English in: Vandenbroeck 2001, p. 51.
12. Van Puyvelde 1963, p. 63.
13. Silva Maroto 2000, p. 549.
14. Silva Maroto 2001, p. 42.
15. Vázquez Dueñas 2016a, p. 160.
16. Translated into English in: Silva Maroto 2001, p. 43.
17. Vázquez Dueñas 2016a, p. 162.
18. Translated into English in: Silva Maroto 2001, p. 45.
19. Vázquez Dueñas 2016a, p. 161.
20. Ceán Bermúdez 2001, p. 227.
21. Lapuerta Montoya 2002, pp. 329-33.

22. Mateo Gómez 1967, pp. 47-53.
23. Vázquez Dueñas 2016a, p. 160.
24. Translated into English in: Vandenbroeck 2001, p. 56.
25. Vázquez Dueñas 2016a, p.163.
26. *Idem*, p.164.
27. Translated into English in: Vandenbroeck 2001, p. 60.
28. A. Ponz, *Viage de España en que se da noticia de las cosas mas apreciables, y dignas de saberse, que hay en ella*, t. VI, Madrid: por D. Joachin Ibarra, impresor de Camara de S.M., 1776, p. 157: 'Hablando en el 2Tom.de este Viage de la Iglesia vieja del Escorial, se hizo mencion al fol. 152 de una pintura simbólica de Gerónimo Bosch, en que para expresar la locura, y vanidad de los mortales, figuró un carro de heno tirado de algunas bestias, al qual aspiran a subir personas de varios estados, con lo demás que allí se dixo. Esta pintura se halla repetida, y firmada del mismo Bosch en una galería de esta Casa; en donde también hay otra del referido autor, y es igualmente repetición de la que se habló en el citado Tom.2, fol. 240, tratando del Escorial, con la diferencia de que esta de la Casa del Campo esta perfectamente conservada'.
29. Fransen 2003, pp. 75-80.
30. Vázquez Dueñas 2016a, p. 168.
31. García Gainza (ed.) 1980, p. 278; Fernández Pardo (ed.) 1999, pp. 222-24; Diéguez Rodríguez 2012, pp. 490-94.
32. Checa Cremades (ed.) 2002, p. 262.
33. García Gainza (ed.) 1980, p. 278.
34. Bermejo Martínez 1982, p. 129 no 36.
35. Aterido (ed..) 2013, pp. 64-65 (image).
36. Garnelo, 1925, pp. 153-60.
37. Pérez Sánchez (dir.) 1989, p. 122.

References

- A. Aterido (ed.), *Colección Masaveu. Del Románico a la Ilustración. Imagen y materia*, Madrid: Fundación M^aCristina Masaveu Peterson, 2013.
- E. Bermejo Martínez, *La pintura de los primitivos flamencos en España*, II, Madrid: Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas, Instituto "Diego Velázquez", 1982.
- J.C. Calvete de Estrella, *El felicísimo viaje del muy alto y muy poderoso Príncipe don Phelippe* (ed. P. Cuenca), Madrid: Sociedad Estatal para la Conmemoración de los Centenarios de Felipe II y Carlos V, 2001.
- J.A. Ceán Bermúdez, *Diccionario histórico de los más ilustres profesores de las Bellas Artes en España*, Madrid: Akal, Istmo, 2001.
- F. Checa Cremades (ed.), *Erasmus en España. La recepción del humanismo en el primer Renacimiento español*, Madrid: Sociedad Estatal para la Acción Cultural Exterior, 2002.
- F. Checa Cremades (ed.), *Los libros de entregas de Felipe II a El Escorial/ The Escorial Delivery Books of Philip II*, Madrid: Patrimonio Nacional, 2013.
- A. Diéguez Rodríguez, *La pintura flamenca del siglo XVI en el norte de España: Galicia, Asturias, Cantabria, País Vasco y Navarra*, tesis doctoral inédita, Universidad de Santiago de Compostela, 2012.

- F. Fernández Pardo (ed.), *Las tablas flamencas en la Ruta Jacobea*, San Sebastián: Fundación Bsck, 1999.
- B. Fransen, Les copies du Jardin des Délices dans les Collections Royales espagnoles, in: H. Verougstraete, R. Van Schoute (eds.), *Jérôme Bosch et son entourage et autres études*, Leuven / Dudley: Peeters, 2003, pp. 75-80.
- M.C. García Gainza (ed.), *Catálogo monumental de Navarra*, vol. I, Institución Príncipe de Viana, Arzobispo de Pamplona, Universidad de Navarra, 1980.
- J. Garnelo, Visita a las colecciones de arte de los Señores Marqueses de Riscal, *Boletín de la Sociedad Española de Excursiones*, 33 (1925), pp. 153-60.
- J. Koldewej, B. Vermet, B. van Kooij (eds.), *Hieronymus Bosch. New Insights Into His Life and Work*, Ghent: Ludion, Rotterdam: Museum Boijmans Van Beuningen-Nai Publishers, 2001.
- M. Lapuerta Montoya, *Los pintores de la Corte de Felipe III. La Casa Real de El Pardo*, Madrid: Comunidad de Madrid y Fundación Cajamadrid, 2002.
- I. Mateo Gómez, *El Jardín de las Delicias*. A propósito de una copia temprana y un tapiz, *Archivo Español de Arte*, 40-157 (1967), pp. 47-53.
- A. Matilla Tascón, Felipe II adquiere pinturas del Bosco y Patinir, *Goya*, 203 (1988), pp. 258-61.
- A.E. Pérez Sánchez (dir.), *Obras maestras de la Colección Masaveu*, Madrid: Museo del Prado, 1989.
- P. Silva Maroto, J. Yarza Luaces, C. Garrido et al., *El jardín de las delicias de El Bosco: copias, estudio técnico y restauración*, Madrid: Museo Nacional del Prado, 2000.
- P. Silva Maroto, En torno a las obras del Bosco que poseyó Felipe II, in: V. Tovar Martín (ed.), *Felipe II y las Artes*, Universidad Complutense de Madrid, 2000, pp. 533-51.
- P. Silva Maroto, Bosch in Spain: On the Works Recorded in the Royal Inventories, in: J. Koldewej, B. Vermet, B. van Kooij (eds.), *Hieronymus Bosch. New Insights Into His Life and Work*, Ghent: Ludion, Rotterdam: Museum Boijmans Van Beuningen-Nai Publishers, 2001, pp. 41-46.
- P. Vandenbroeck, The Spanish inventarios reales and Hieronymus Bosch, in: J. Koldewej, B. Vermet, B. van Kooij (eds.), *Hieronymus Bosch. New Insights Into His Life and Work*, Ghent: Ludion, Rotterdam: Museum Boijmans Van Beuningen-Nai Publishers, 2001, pp. 49-63.
- L. Van Puyvelde, *Le siècle de Bruegel: la peinture en Belgique au XVIe siècle*, Brussels: Musées Royaux des Beaux-Arts de Belgique, 1963.
- E. Vázquez Dueñas, *El Bosco en las fuentes españolas*, Madrid: Doce Calles, 2016a.
- E. Vázquez Dueñas, *Felipe de Guevara. Comentario de la pintura y pintores antiguos*, Madrid: Akal, 2016b.
- E. Vázquez Dueñas, The Guevaras as Collectors of Netherlandish Art at the Spanish Court, in: D. Van Heesch, R. Janssen, J. Van der Stock (eds.), *Netherlandish Art and Luxury Goods in Renaissance Spain. Studies in honor of Professor Jan Karel Steppe (1918-2009)*, London/Turnhout: Harvey Miller Publishers, 2018, pp. 165-80.

Colophon

The conference 'Defining boundaries: Jheronimus Bosch, his workshop, and his followers', May 11-13, 2023, was organized by the Jheronimus Bosch Art Center.

Programme committee:

Prof.dr Ron Spronk (chair), dr Eric De Bruyn, em.prof.dr Jos Koldeweij,
drs Willeke Cornelissen, Jo Timmermans

Copy editors:

Erlend de Groot and Frances Kemp

Executive editor:

Jo Timmermans

Editors:

Jos Koldeweij, Willeke Cornelissen

Layout:

Loes Scholten

Print:

Wilco Art Books

© 2023, Jheronimus Bosch Art Center and the authors.

Nothing in this publication may be reproduced without specific, written permission from the publisher and the author(s).

ISBN/EAN: 978-90-833216-1-5

NUR 654