



CANTUS PLANUS

Study Group of the International Musicological Society

Papers read at the 16th meeting
Vienna, Austria, 2011



OAW
Österreichische Akademie
der Wissenschaften

Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften
Kommission für Musikforschung
Wien 2012

VERLAG BRÜDER HOLLNEK

ISBN 978 3-85119-336-7

Edited by

Robert Klugseder

with the members of the CANTUS PLANUS Advisory Board

James Borders, Christelle Cazaux-Kowalski, Lori Kruckenberg, Frank Lawrence,
Jeremy Llewellyn, Christian Troelsgård, Anna Vildera
and Hanna Zühlke

Supported by

Benediktinerstift Admont

Augustinerchorherrenstift Klosterneuburg

Benediktinerstift St. Lambrecht

Augustinerchorherrenstift Voralpe

Design and Layout

Florian Goller, Robert Klugseder and Elise Madl

Alle Rechte vorbehalten. Ohne schriftliche Genehmigung des Verlages dürfen diese Publikation oder Teile daraus nicht in andere Sprachen übersetzt oder in irgend einer Form mit mechanischen oder elektronischen Mitteln (einschließlich Photokopie, Tonaufnahme und Mikrokopie) reproduziert oder auf einem Datenträger oder einem Computersystem gespeichert werden.

© 2012 by Verlagsbuchhandlung Brüder Hollinek, A-3002 Purkersdorf
Hersteller: Verlagsbuchhandlung Brüder Hollinek, A-3002 Purkersdorf

Für die Einholung der Erlaubnis zur Veröffentlichung der Abbildungen sind ausschließlich die einzelnen Autoren zuständig.

For obtaining the permission to publish the images,
only the individual authors are responsible.

Printed in Hungary

Inhalt

Vorwort des Herausgebers	7
In memoriam László Dobszay.....	8
In memoriam Michel Huglo.....	9
Vienna CP, Opening Welcome	
<i>Barbara Haggh-Huglo.....</i>	<i>10</i>
Newly discovered Antiphoners in northern Portugal	
<i>Diogo Alte da Veiga</i>	<i>13</i>
The Anonymus Vaticanus and the Paleofrankish Script	
<i>Charles M. Atkinson.....</i>	<i>20</i>
Tone-series in ecclesiastical chant	
<i>Terence Bailey</i>	<i>27</i>
The Dominican Antiphoner from the Badija Franciscan Monastery near Korčula: The Question of Provenance*	
<i>Hrvoje Beban</i>	<i>33</i>
Beobachtungen zur Seckauer Prozessionspraxis anhand des Liber ordinarius A-Gu 756 von 1345 - Cum vero processionem facimus quasi hostibus armati obviamus	
<i>Inga Behrendt.....</i>	<i>38</i>
Interrelations between theory and practice. Influence of theorists' pattern-antiphons on initial formulas of some introits and graduals	
<i>Robert Bernagiewicz</i>	<i>44</i>
FAMULA DEI - textliche und musikalische Besonderheiten in den Meßproprien heiliger Frauen in adiastematischen Handschriften aus St. Gallen und Einsiedeln	
<i>Dirk van Betteray</i>	<i>51</i>
A (Brief) Introduction to Post-Tridentine Pontifical Chants	
<i>James Borders</i>	<i>58</i>
Examples of Liturgical Polyphony from Dalmatia	
<i>Hana Breko Kustura.....</i>	<i>66</i>
The Web of Sources for Planctus ante nescia	
<i>Charles E. Brewer</i>	<i>72</i>
Processing from Lateran to Hierusalem and Back: A Unique Ritual for the Cross Relic	
<i>Clyde Brockett</i>	<i>78</i>
Mensura as a technical term in chant theory	
<i>John Caldwell</i>	<i>84</i>
Beyond diastemata: specific and semitonic indications in the gradual of Saint-Yrieix (Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale de France, Latin 903, XIth century)	
<i>Christelle Cazaux-Kowalski</i>	<i>89</i>
Traditionalism and New Influences in an 18th Century Gradual of the Zagreb Cathedral with a Special Focus on the Alleluia Repertory	
<i>Orsolya Csomó.....</i>	<i>96</i>
Die coniunctae des Corpus Hollandrinum in den mitteleuropäischen Choralhandschriften	
<i>Zsuzsa Czagány.....</i>	<i>102</i>
The question of plainchant notation in French Post-Tridentine sources Towards a specific semiology	
<i>Cécile Davy-Rigaux</i>	<i>113</i>

A Newly Discovered Source of Ordinary Chants in Cantus Planus and Cantus Fractus: A Preliminary Report <i>Joseph Dyer</i>	121
Die Evangeliumsantiphonen der Donnerstage in der Fastenzeit <i>David Eben</i>	127
Die liturgischen Handschriften aus St. Lambrecht (Steiermark) <i>Stefan Engels</i>	135
A Portuguese plainchant treatise <i>Manuel Pedro Ferreira</i>	143
Medieval Music through the Technological Looking-Glass <i>Carmen Julia Gutiérrez</i>	149
CORPUS MONODICUM – Die einstimmige Musik des lateinischen Mittelalters <i>Andreas Haug</i>	159
‘Venite et videte’: First Results in the Optical Neume Recognition Project <i>Kate Helsen, with Inga Behrendt and Alan Sexton</i>	161
CANTUS PLANUS REGENSBURG – Web Archive for Gregorian Chant <i>David Hiley and Robert Klugseder</i>	166
The Sequence <i>Sancti Spiritus</i> in the Nidaros Tradition <i>Marit Johanne Høy</i>	168
Assonance, Variation, Repetition: Editing Prosulas to the Gloria Chant <i>Gunilla Iversen</i>	178
The Tridentinum as a Watershed in the Evolution of Mass cycles <i>Gábor Kiss</i>	186
Medieval musical manuscripts and fragments in the Austrian National Library (ÖNB), Vienna <i>Robert Klugseder</i>	192
Renewal, Revival, Rejuvenation: a New Vision for the CANTUS Database <i>Jan Kolářček and Debra Lacoste</i>	202
Compositions of <i>Credo</i>: Influences of Latin settings on the respective Byzantine ones of Cretan origin (16th-17th cent.) <i>Flora Kritikou</i>	210
Elastic Melodies: Variants in Responsory Verses <i>Debra Lacoste</i>	218
Cultural Intersections in the Transmission of Office Hymns in the Southern Low Countries <i>Sarah Ann Long</i>	226
Liturgical-musical sources in the votive processions of the bishop of Padua, Pietro Barozzi (1443-1507) <i>Antonio Lovato</i>	233
Toward a Methodology for Analyzing the Old Hispanic Responsories <i>Rebecca Maloy and Emma Hornby</i>	242
Habitable surface, habitable space: Graphic contour and melodic constraints for Buddhist chant in early Japan <i>Elizabeth Markham</i>	250
Vind. Suppl. gr. 121: ein Fragment eines Tetraevangeliiars mit ekphonetischer Notation in der Österreichischen Nationalbibliothek* <i>Sandra Martani</i>	259
Das von Johannes Winterburger gedruckte Antiphonar aus dem Jahr 1519: ein <i>Antiphonale Pataviense</i>? <i>David Merlin</i>	267
From the rite of the Oblation to the offering scene in the <i>Officium Stellae</i> musico-liturgical drama. <i>Reges Tharsis et insulae munera offerent, reges Arabum et Saba dona adducent</i> <i>Nausica Morandi</i>	276

Digital Editing of chant - tools in progress <i>Stefan Johannes Morent</i>	281
“Fecit” quattuor historie? <i>Ann-Marie Nilsson</i>	284
Antiphonal Psalmody in Western Monasticism from the Fourth to the Seventh Century <i>Edward Nowacki</i>	295
Traditio Iohannis Hollandrini - Tonare <i>Ágnes Papp</i>	301
Non Pitch-Specific Notation in Practice and Transcription: Beneventan Chant in <i>campo aperto</i> and <i>in voce</i> <i>Matthew Peattie</i>	309
Musical references in Serbian hagiography (<i>Žitija</i>) and liturgical poetry (<i>Srbljak</i>) <i>Ivana Perković</i>	316
Zur Vorgeschichte des lateinischen Acht-Tonarten-Systems <i>Andreas Pfisterer</i>	321
A Pair of Manuscripts transmitting the Triodion and Pentekostarion in the Russian Studite Tradition - Identifying the prototypes <i>Svetlana Poliakova</i>	327
Gesang an der Peripherie – Die Choralhandschriften in der Bibliothek des Augustiner-Chorherrenstiftes Vorau <i>Franz Karl Praßl</i>	332
Un foyer d’avant-garde dans l’introduction du chant grégorien en Castille: La cathédrale de Palencia (1034-1080) <i>Juan Pablo Rubio</i>	344
Political changes and music writing styles in 11th century Bologna <i>Cesarino Ruini</i>	349
The Application of the CANTUS Analysis Tool to the Neumed Breviary VI E 4c from St George’s Convent, Prague <i>Tereza Seifertová</i>	355
Ruotlib’s notated missal and its historical background <i>Jurij Snoj</i>	361
Notation als Spiegel der Veränderungen in der “nunquam reformata” Tradition am Beispiel der mittelalterlichen Antiphonarien aus der Kartause Žiže (Seiz/Seitz). <i>Katarina Šter</i>	367
Das Sequenzenrepertoire der österreichischen Benediktiner <i>Györgyi Táborosky</i>	376
Musical liturgical fragments in the Historical Municipal Archive of Casperia (Latium - Italy) <i>Nicola Tangari</i>	383
Castles of faith: The transmission of the Kyrie trope set <i>Deus solus et immensus</i> as an example of liturgical exegesis in the orthodoxy <i>Arturo Tello Ruiz-Pérez</i>	388
Inedite fonti italiane della Passione in notazione ritmico-proporzionale <i>Diego Toigo</i>	394
The Hymnic Corpus in the Manuscript Plainsong Choirbooks at Segovia Cathedral - Tradition, Re-elaboration and New Composition* <i>Santiago Ruiz Torres</i>	403
The conception of the chant of the ‘Other’: evidence from medieval literary sources <i>Christian Troelsgård</i>	408
Pitch, Rhythm and Text-Setting in Palaeofrankish Notation: The Case of London, British Library, Harley MS 3019 <i>Giovanni Varelli</i>	413

Liturgical contradictions and political consistency in the liturgico-musical tradition of St. Mark's, Venice <i>Anna Vildera</i>	419
Offertoriale Arnesti: A Forthcoming Edition of Plainchant Offertories with Verses from Bohemian Sources <i>Jana Vozková</i>	425
The New Web site www.chantdiscography.com: A Demonstration <i>Jerome F. Weber</i>	429
Untersuchungen zur lateinischen Tradition des byzantinischen Akathistos Hymnus <i>Gerda Wolfram</i>	431
Die musikalisch-liturgischen Quellen des Hochmittelalters aus dem österreichischen Benediktinerstift Admont <i>Hanna Zühlke</i>	438
 PROGRAM	453

Castles of faith:

The transmission of the Kyrie trope set *Deus solus et immensus* as an example of liturgical exegesis in the orthodoxy

Arturo Tello Ruiz-Pérez

Deus solus et immensus. The sentence is categorical and unequivocal and leaves little room for doubt: one single, immense and unfathomable God. It reveals that human reason can only approach the mystery of God from a negative, apophatic perspective. Nevertheless, it should be borne in mind that this negative path is by no means new in the history of Christian theology and spirituality; indeed, it is possible to trace a methodological arc through Antiquity and the Middle Ages that covers from the speculative rationality of St Clement of Alexandria to the *docta ignorantia* of Nicholas of Cusa. By way of synopsis, it is almost impossible to avoid recalling the famous words of St Augustine against the Arians: “De Deo loquimur, quid mirum si non comprehendis? Si enim comprehendis, non est Deus” (*Sermo* 117, 3, 5. PL 38, col. 663).

Bringing up this quotation, which is precisely against Arianism, allows me to raise the question of the danger of possible misinterpretation from the heterodoxy of the proposition “Deus solus et immensus”. In this respect, in his letter to the Bishop St Alexander of Alexandria, Arius himself confesses apophatically as a profession of faith: “ἓνα θεόν, μόνον ἀγέννητον, μόνον αἰδίον, μόνον ἀναρχόν, μόνον ἀληθινόν, μόνον ἀθανασίαν ἔχοντα” [one only God, who is alone uncreated, alone eternal, alone without beginning, alone true, alone immortal] (*Arius ad Alexandrum*, St Athanasius, *De Synodis* 19, PG 26, col. 708D). And what if our sentence should not fit perfectly within this creed? It does, of course. The problem lies in the consideration of Christ and the Holy Spirit.

In the Arian system, nothing can be compared to the Father because “ἴσον οὐδὲ ὅμοιον, οὐχ ὁμόδοξον ἔχει μόνος οὗτος” [He alone has no equal; nobody compares to him or is on a par with him in glory] (*Blasphemiae Arii*, St Athanasius, *De Synodis* 15, PG 26, col. 705D). The one and only Arian God lives in the absolute solitude of the uncreated and the eternal, establishing a yawning abyss of dissimilarity between Himself and what has been created. Without doubt, this approach shatters the revealed image of the triune God, at the same time as it drastically and dramatically separates the creator from the created. Likewise, creation itself is devalued because it is unable to demonstrate anything more than the immanence of a created intermediary Logos that “ἴδιον οὐδὲν ἔχει τοῦ θεοῦ καθ’ ὑπόστασιν ιδιότητος, οὐδὲ γάρ ἐστιν ἴσος, ἀλλ’ οὐδὲ ὁμοούσιος αὐτῷ” [nothing in his own hypostases is inherently of God, for he is not God’s equal, nor is he consubstantial] (*Blasphemiae Arii*, St Athanasius, *De Synodis* 15, PG 26, col. 708A). The rupture between God and the world is therefore radical and unequivocal, so that the transcendence of His divinity remains isolated from any glance that might reveal it. Where, then, does that leave Johannine passages such as Jn 1, 18; 10, 30; or 14, 9?

This concept of Arianism was firmly opposed by the faith the Church maintained from its very beginnings: communion with Christ is communion with God, and the gift of the Holy Spirit is the gift of God Himself. Among those who championed the anti-Arian reaction were St Athanasius and the Cappadocians, the crowning point was the Nicene Creed. There is no doubt that the key word in all this is *homoousios* (ὁμοούσιος), that is, the same substance, allowing the Son and the Holy Spirit to reveal and proclaim the Father. What is more, they do not form part of God, but are God: Three Persons (ὑποστάσεις) and one single substance, acting trinitarily and revealing that God is a Trinity. As St Gregory of Nyssa eloquently puts it: “ἀλλὰ τις ἄρρητος καὶ ἀκατανόητος ἐν τούτοις καταλαμβάνεται καὶ ἡ κοινωνία καὶ ἡ διάκρισις, οὔτε τῆς τῶν ὑποστάσεων διαφορᾶς τὸ τῆς φύσεως συνεχὲς διασπώσης, οὔτε κατὰ τῆς οὐσίας κοινότητος τὸ ἰδιάζον τῶν γνωρισμάτων ἀναχεύσης” (St Basil of Caesarea,

Epistola 38, 4, PG 32, cols. 332D-333A).¹ With respect to this point, however, it should be stressed that the way each Person acts coincides fully with his personal being, from which it can be inferred that it is precisely the characteristics and distinguishing elements of each Person (in other words, what at first sight would appear to separate them) that establish their link of loving communion with the other two. Thus, it is characteristic of the Holy Spirit to be recognised as the Son and proceed from the Father, just as it is of the Son to be begotten of the Father and manifest the Holy Spirit. And nevertheless, despite being a reality with three hypostases, the unity of God covers the unity of loving and doing.

After these considerations on the foundations underlying the rationale behind the establishment of Trinitarian faith in the 4th century, in the unity of essence and hypostatic distinction, it is time to pose some questions on the origins, purpose and distribution of the Kyrie trope set *Deus solus et immensus* (Bjork 1977, I: 62-63 and II: 413-416, 1979-1980, 1980a, 1980b; BTC II/1 1989, I: 37-38; Castro 1989, 472; Doyle 2000, II: 40; Tello 2006, I: 173-176 and II: 42-48, 2011, I: 178-181 and II: 43-49), which is a composition with a distinct Trinitarian stamp and progressively takes on the meaning of an authentic profession of faith.

It is evident from the Table that this collection was initially copied in manuscripts from the Eastern parts of the Frankish Kingdom (St Gall, Eichstätt, Regensburg). Logically, if it was extensively copied there for the first time, it is very likely that it was also created in its eight-phrase version at some place lying on this particular axis. From this area, the collection travelled to the Abruzzi, in central Italy, and to Auch and Yrieix, in the far south of France, stopping over in Apt, a strategic location where repertoires of liturgical song were customarily transmitted (CT V 1986). During this transition period, the collection of eight elements was reduced to seven (Apt 18, Pa 1118 and Vat 4770) and then to six (Pa 903). It finally reached Spain at the very end of the 12th century (as a series of eight elements with square notation in Pa 495) and became rooted in the canonical community of the Cathedral of Gerona, where it was performed until the 16th century. In the 13th and 14th centuries, the set was periodically transmitted in a new version reduced to three elements to other communities in the Tarraconensis region (Cathedral of Tortosa and Parish Church of Montblanc).

Over this long journey in time and space, *Deus solus et immensus* acquired various traits that were adapted to the needs and tastes of each particular epoch and place. Due to lack of space ~~ok~~, I shall focus mainly on two of these: the melody of the ~~basic chant~~ and the arrangement and number of elements with respect to the base chant.

We are dealing here with a logogene trope and this mark of independence in relation to the base chant allows it to be linked freely and without too much difficulty to various Kyrie melodies. At the heart of its origin, the East, the basic melody is Melnicki 144 - with the sole exception of Mü 14083 - as it is for Apt 18. The Kyrie changes, however, when it appears in other southern (Pa 1118 and Pa 903) and Spanish sources: the melodies Melnicki 155 and 103 appear, together with one that is autochthonous to Catalonia (this does not appear in the Melnicki 1955 catalogue), which was pointed out at the time by Anglès (1935, 208-210).² Strangely enough, in this last case, the mutation of the base melody of the Kyrie creates a whole new version for the elements of the group (see Examples 1 and 2). It is evident that there is a change of concept in this group of Kyrie tropes following their arrival in these regions, which does not pass unnoticed to the nature of the melodies.

Within the group from eastern sources, ~~the elements are usually interpolated after each invocation. In this form~~ they were transmitted to Vat 4770 and some Spanish sources (Pa 495 and GerM a), but not to Apt 18, to other southern sources or to the rest of the Spanish sources. Apart from the stylistic features

¹) Most scholars are currently in agreement on the attribution of this letter to St Gregory of Nyssa, the younger brother of St Basil (Hübner 1972, 463-490).

²) This Kyrie melody is also found untroped in Vic, Biblioteca del Museo Episcopal, ms. 105, ss. 11th ex/12th, Vic, f. 50v.

that naturally characterise each tradition (logogene tropes from western sources are actually much less frequent in the Kyrie in comparison with the favoured Latin-texted Kyrie and Kyrie prosulae), this circumstance also has theological overtones.

Let us look briefly at a normalized version of the Pa 495 text and consider it in the light of what has been put forward so far:

KYRIE ELEISON

A. Deus solus et immensus

KYRIE ELEISON

B. Plasmator hominum et
cunctae creaturae tuae

KYRIE ELEISON

C. Qui de supernis nobis
compassus ad ima venisti

CHRISTE ELEISON

D. Atque hominem perditum
de morte revocasti

CHRISTE ELEISON

E. Ipsumque in patriam
caeli locasti

CHRISTE ELEISON

F. Perditum pridem gratis
consortem supernis egisti

KYRIE ELEISON

G. Pater cum nato nostri
misertus maneto

KYRIE ELEISON

H. Sanctusque qui omnia regit
semper nobis spiritus assit

KYRIE ELEISON

As we have seen, A can only refer to the Father and his immensity. At first sight, it may appear that B also addresses the person of the Father, but it actually refers to the Son (see Col. 1, 15-16). This perhaps explains the use of the noun “plasmator” instead of “creator” in order to emphasise co-participation by the Son, true God and true Man. Likewise, the fact that the invocation KYRIE ELEISON precedes this and the other elements, establishing the premise that the Son must be praised with the same glory and dignity as the Father and the Holy Spirit. The rest of the elements up to F are subordinate to the person of the Son, who, touched in the Trinitarian chain by the affection that comes from the Father’s mercy, is the will that articulates the economy of salvation. Element G explicitly confirms this. The final element, with a hint to Notker’s sequence for Pentecost (*Sancti spiritus assit gratia*), completes the petition for grace and mercy with invocation of the Spirit.

I believe that, of all these questions, one is particularly pressing: Is there any reason that explains this approach? In an attempt to answer this, I shall briefly present some hypotheses on the basis of the origin and diffusion of *Deus solus et immensus*.

~~ok~~In the same way as the Church, in its reaction to Arianism, enjoyed a creative impetus that produced some wonderful hymns and chants, this trope set (like so many others) could have been gestated in the atmosphere of opposition from orthodoxy to another heterodox approach: that of adoptionism. This aspect possibly goes back to the 9th century; that the first written sources to transmit it should date from the middle of the 10th century is a different matter. More concisely, the adoptionist doctrine (embraced by Elipandus of Toledo and Felix of Urgell) proposes that Christ as a man is only the Son of God by adoption. Therefore, by virtue of this double filiation, his hypostatic being is separated

and two persons are assumed (an approach that appears to be a revival of ancient Nestorianism).

The fact that the first manuscripts that transmit this composition come from regions close to where main councils and polemics against heresy took place -Regensburg (792) and Frankfurt (794)- lends support to this hypothesis. Figures such as Alcuin of York (to whom the expression that gives the title to this paper is attributed),³ St Paulinus of Aquileia, St Benedict of Aniane and Charlemagne himself all universalised Hispanic heresy. In this sense, the exegetic and catechetical aspect of tropes and other sorts of liturgical song contained in the liturgy cannot be denied. Similarly, the survival and success of our composition centuries later, as well as in Catalonia and the south of France, could be due to a new attempt at a pastoral response from liturgy to another heterodox virus, that of the Cathar heresy, which had infected these territories to dramatic effect. In general terms, as is well known, in the Cathar doctrine two creative principles co-exist in differing degrees: one good and spiritual - God - and the other evil and material - Satan - (Dondaine 1939; Nelli 1959). What mostly interests us here is that Christ was considered to be neither God nor man, but an angelic entity favoured by God whose body became apparent (similar to the belief embraced by Docetism). Salvation does not come through Trinitarian mercy overflowing with love; it comes exclusively through spiritual perfection, which disdains any ~~ok~~thing material, in the form of the *perfecti*, or purified by the *consolamentum*, the only valid sacrament in the Cathar church.

I shall conclude my argument in favour of such a theological interpretation by quoting an extract from the profession of faith against the Cathars of the Fourth Lateran Council. In this, not only are the beginnings of our composition cited almost literally, but this is placed, like a document in escrow, at the centre of a battle between authentic castles of faith. Most importantly, it is done from within the Franco-Roman liturgy itself, at the moment of the Kyrie:

“Firmiter credimus et simpliciter confitemur, quod unus solus est verus Deus, aeternus, immensus et incommutabilis, incomprehensibilis omnipotens et ineffabilis, Pater et Filius et Spiritus Sanctus: tres quidem personae, sed una essentia, substantia seu natura simplex omnino: Pater a nullo, Filius a Patre solo, ac Spiritus Sanctus pariter ab utroque: absque initio, semper ac sine fine: Pater generans, Filius nascens, et Spiritus Sanctus procedens: consubstantiales et coaequales et coomnipotentes et coaeterni [...]” (Denzinger 1854, 110-111)

Literature cited:

- Anglès, Higiní**, *La música a Catalunya fins al segle XIII*, Barcelona: Biblioteca de Catalunya, 1935.
- Bjork, David**, *The Kyrie Repertory in Aquitanian Manuscripts of the Tenth and Eleventh Centuries*, 2 vols., PhD Berkley, 1977.
- Idem**, ‘Early Repertories of the Kyrie eleison’, *Kirchenmusikalisches Jahrbuch* 63-64, 1979-1980, 9-43.
- Idem**, ‘The Kyrie Trope’, *Journal of American Musicological Society* 33, 1980a, 1-41.
- Idem**, ‘Early Settings of the Kyrie Eleison and the Problem of Genre Definition’, *Journal of the Plainsong & Mediaeval Music* 3, 1980b, 40-48.
- Boe, John** (ed.), *Beneventanum Troporum Corpus II: Ordinary Chants and Tropes for the Mass from Southern Italy, A.D. 1000-1250. Part 1: Kyrie eleison*, 2 vols., Madison, Wisconsin: AR Editions, 1989. (BTC II/1)
- Castro Caridad, Eva**, *Estudios literarios sobre troparios hispánicos*, PhD Universidad de Santiago de Compostela, 1989.
- Björkvall, Gunilla**, *Corpus Troporum V. Les Deux Tropaires d’Apt, mss. 17 et 18: Inventaire analytique des mss. et édition des textes uniques*, Stockholm: Almqvist & Wiksell, 1986. (CT V)
- Denzinger, Heinrich Joseph D.**, *Enchiridion Symbolorum et Definitionum, Quae in Rebus Fidei et Morum a Conciliis Oecumenicis et Summis Pontificibus Emanarunt*, Würzburg: Stahel, 1854.

³ “Nec errare putandus est qui cum talibus intra catholicae fidei castra moratur” (*Epistola* 203. Dümmler 1895, 337).

- Dondaine, Antoine**, *Un traité néo-manichéen du XIII siècle: le Liber de duobus principiis, suivi d'un fragment de Rituel Cathare*, Roma: Instituto storico Domenicano, S. Sabina, 1939.
- Doyle, Alicia M.**, *The Repertory of Tropes in Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale fonds Latin 1118. A Comparative Study of Tenth Century Aquitanian Concordances and Transmission*, 2 vols., PhD University of California Santa Barbara, 2000.
- Dümmeler, Ernts** (ed.), *Epistolarum tomus IV. Karolini aevi II*, (MGH), Berlin: Weidmann, 1895.
- Hübner, Reinhard**, 'Gregor von Nyssa als Verfasser der sog. Ep. 38 des Basiliius', in: Fontaine, Jacques and Kannengiesser, Charles (eds.), *Epektasis* (Festschrift Cardinal Jean Daniélou), Paris: Beauchesne, 1972, 463-490.
- Landwehr-Melnicki, Margaretha**, *Das einstimmige Kyrie des lateinischen Mittelalters*, Regensburg: Bosse, 1955.
- Nelli, René**, *Ecritures Cathares*, Paris: Editions Denoël, 1959.
- Migne, Jacques-Paul** (ed.), *Patrologiae cursus completus. Series graeca*, 161 vols., Paris: Petit-Montrouge, 1857-1866. (PG)
- Idem** (ed.), *Patrologiae cursus completus. Series latina*, 221 vols., Paris: Petit-Montrouge, 1844-1864. (PL)
- Tello Ruiz-Pérez, Arturo**, *Transferencias del canto medieval: los tropos del Ordinarium Missae en los manuscritos españoles*, 2 vols., PhD Universidad Complutense de Madrid, 2006.
- Idem**, *Transmisión del canto litúrgico en la Edad Media. Los tropos del Ordinarium Missae en España*, 2 vols., Saarbrücken: LAP LAMBERT/Editorial Académica Española, 2011.

Table

Source	Signature	Fol.	Century	Year	Provenance	Area	Number of elements	Kyrie Melody	Feast
Pa 495	Paris Bibl. Nat. n. a. lat. 495	10r	XII in		Gerona	Spain	8	Melnicki 103	Christmas I
Tsa 135	Tortosa Bibl. Cap. 135	5r	XIII med	1228-1264	Tortosa	Spain	3	Unknown	
Mont 5	Montblanc Arch. parroq. de la Iglesia de Santa María ms. 5	6r	XIV in / med		Montblanc, Iglesia de Sta María	Spain	3	Unknown	
Bar 911	Barcelona Bibl. de Catalunya M. 911	20r	XV		Gerona	Spain	3	Unknown	Dominica in albis
GerM	Gerona Museo Diocesano Mus. s.n.	565	XV / XVI	1480-1520	Gerona	Spain	8	Melnicki 103	Christmas I
GerM	Gerona Museo Diocesano Mus. s.n.	571	XV / XVI	1480-1520	Gerona	Spain	3	Unknown	Dominica in albis
Pa 1118	Paris Bibl. Nat. lat. 1118	19r	X ex / XI in		Gascogne, Auch / Aurillac ?	Meridional Group	7	Melnicki 155	St Stephen
Apt 18	Apt Arch. Bas. S. Anne 18 (4)	69v	X / XI in		Apt ?	Meridional Group	7	Melnicki 144	Assumption
Pa 903	Paris Bibl. Nat. lat. 903	165v	XI med / ex		St Yrieix	Meridional Group	6	Melnicki 155	
SG 381	Sankt Gallen Stiftsbibl. 381	295	X	965 ?	Sankt Gallen	East	8	Melnicki 144	
SG 484	Sankt Gallen Stiftsbibl. 484	209	X	965 ?	Sankt Gallen	East	8	Melnicki 144	
Ox 27	Oxford Bodleian Libr. Hs. Selden supra 27	83r	XI in		Eichstätt / Freising ?	East	8	Melnicki 144	
Be 11	Berlin Staatsbibl. th. lat. IV ^o 11	78v	XI	1024-1027	Minden (<Sankt Gallen)	East	8	Melnicki 144	
Mü 14083	Munich Bayerische Staatsbibl. Clm. 14083	103r	XI	1031-1037	Regensburg, Sankt Emmeram	East	8	Melnicki 151	
Vat 4770	Roma Bibl. Apostolica Vaticana Palat. lat. 4770	117r	X ex / XI in		Abruzzi	Italy	7	s. n.	Easter

Example 1

f. 10r
 Pa 495
 8 De - us so - lus et in - men - sus
 p. 565
 GerM
 8 De - us so - lus et in - men - sus
 f. 69v
 Apt 18
 De - us so - lus et in - men - sus
 f. 19r
 Pa 1118
 8 De - us so - lus et in - men - sus
 f. 165v
 Pa 903
 8 De - us so - lus et im - men - sus
 p. 295
 SG 381
 De - us so - lus et im - men - sus
 p. 209
 SG 484
 De - us so - lus et im - men - sus
 f. 83r
 Ox 27
 De - us so - lus et in - men - sus
 f. 78v
 Be 11
 De - us so - lus et in - men - sus
 f. 103r
 Mü 14083
 De - us so - lus et in - men - sus
 f. 117r
 Vat 4770
 De - us so - lus et in - men - sus

Example 2

f. 5r
 Tsa 135
 8 De - us so - lus et in - men - sus E - LE - Y - SON
 f. 6r
 Mont 5
 8 De - us so - lus et in - men - sus HE - LEY - SON
 f. 20r
 Bar 911
 8 De - us so - lus et im - men - sus E - LEY - SON
 p. 571
 GerM
 8 De - us so - lus et in - men - sus E - LE - Y - SON